

Policy and Finance Committee 17th February 2020

Museum Roof – Approval of Contractor

Report of the Deputy Town Clerk

Full procurement for the replacement of the Museums flat roof covering has been undertaken in line with the Councils financial regulations and the requirements of the Government Contract procurement scheme.

A full report from the councils Maintenance administrator (S J Surveyors) has been attached for the committee's reference.

The specification for this tender took into account the budget agreed by council of £119,000 Option B from report 19th August 2019 with the agreed funding as follows:

EMR allocation for Museum (to be replaced via budget setting over a period of time tbc)	£55,000
HLF retention payment due 2019	£27,400
General reserve contribution	£36,600
Total	£119,000

The quotations received all fall well within this allocated amount and therefore will reduce the amount needed from General Reserves.

It would be prudent to award this contract asap to enable lead times by the contractor to enable works to start in the Spring / summer – in liaison with the Museum Manager.

For information only:

It should be noted that John West Contractors were the main build contractor when the museum underwent refurbishment in 2016 – 2017, as such they have the advantage of having a full understanding of the museum building and works that were undertaken in this refurbishment in relation to the Atrium roof and guttering systems that were upgraded.

Members are requested to:

1. Consider the content of the report provided by SJ Surveyors the appointment of John West Contractors
2. Appoint a building contractor to undertake the Museum roof replacement.



Tender Report
Replacement of Flat Roof Coverings
Weston Museum
Burlington Street
Weston-super-Mare
BS23 1PR

Contract Ref: 19/142

On Behalf Of
Weston-super-Mare
Town Council
Grove House
Grove Park
Weston-super-Mare
BS23 2QJ

Prepared By:
SJ Surveyors Ltd
Chartered Surveyors
12 Woodstock Road
Milton
Weston-super-Mare
BS22 8AH

Tel: 01934 628698
www.sjsurveyors.com
mail@sjsurveyors.com

Contents

- 1.0 Introduction
- 2.0 Tender Process & Returns
- 3.0 Technical Assessment
- 4.0 Financial Assessment
- 5.0 Summary & Recommendations

Appendices

- A- Completed Forms of Tender
- B- John West Priced Documents
- C- Span Roofing Priced Documents

1.0 Introduction

1.01 Generally

This Tender assessment provides an analysis of the tenders returned in response to an enquiry in connection with the replacement of the flat roof coverings and associated works at Weston Museum, Burlington St, Weston-super-Mare BS23 1PR

2.0 Tender Process & Returns

2.01 Generally

This section of the tender assessment provides an analysis of the tenders returned for the repairs in response to enquiries sent on out on 13 January 2020 to seven contractors for the works at Weston Museum. The seven contractors were:

1. John West (Contractors) Ltd
2. Chedvale Construction Ltd
3. Span Roofing Contractors Ltd
4. Industrial Roofing Construction & Design Ltd T/A Rooftech
5. Cablesheer (Asbestos) Limited
6. Honeyfield Property Services
7. Hearn and Sons Roofing Limited

2.02 Tenders

Tenders were received from the five contractors listed below, by 12 noon Friday 07 February 2020 in accordance with tender instructions, Rooftech have declined to tender as they cannot undertake the specified works, Cablesheer (Asbestos) Limited have failed to submit or notify.

Although the tenders are qualified with conditions and comments that may or will affect the actual figure the work will cost. The tender figures are below, these are excluding VAT:-

	<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Tender Return</u>
1.	John West (Contractors) Ltd	£78,475.00 plus VAT
2.	Span Roofing Ltd	£84,346.00 plus VAT
3.	Honeyfield Property Services Ltd	£87,444.36 plus VAT
4.	Chedvale Construction Ltd	£93,121.00 plus VAT
5.	Hearn & Sons Roofing Ltd	£126,570.00 plus VAT

Following the opening of the tenders, copies of the completed schedule of works and contract requirements were requested from the contractors who submitted the lowest two tenders for assessment and checking.

Notes:

The Tenders were delivered to the offices of Weston-super-Mare Town Council and opened by two Councillors and an officer of the council in accordance with the tender documentation.

3.0 Technical Assessment

3.01 Technical Submission Generally

The tenders are qualified which may vary the contract sum, please refer to the financial information in section 2.03 of this report. However, the submissions received are technically in order for contract purposes.

3.02 Programme and Phasing

All of the contractors have indicated their programmes for the works, lead in times for four of the contractors are also indicated, these timescales will need to be confirmed and will commence from the receipt of a written instruction for the works.

<u>Contractor</u>	<u>Lead-in</u>	<u>Contract Period</u>
1. John West (Contractors) Ltd	3 weeks	8 weeks
2. Span Roofing Ltd	2 weeks	6 weeks
3. Honeyfield Property Services Ltd	3 weeks	8 weeks
4. Chedvale Construction Ltd	TBA	6 weeks
5. Hearn & Sons Roofing Ltd	4 weeks	8 weeks

The contract periods suggested by the contractors are between 6 and 8 weeks and a contract period of 8 weeks should be used for programming of the works at this stage. This can be confirmed when a contractor is selected.

3.03 Contract Conditions, Warranties, Insurances

There were no qualifications, queries or changes contained in the tenders received with regard to contract conditions, warranties or insurance.

3.04 Site Set-up

No specific site set up plans were submitted with the initial tenders. The lowest two contractors, John West (Contractors) Ltd and Span Roofing Ltd have submitted the priced specifications and additional information.

Both contractors have allowed within their costs to situate a self-contained welfare unit in Burlington Street for the use of the operatives undertaking the works.

3.05 Health & Safety/Quality Control

The successful Contractor will have to submit acceptable Health & Safety and Quality Control proposals. This will include a detailed Health & Safety Plan for the project. As the contract involves working at height, access and fall prevention are critical elements. The two contractors have slightly different approaches to these elements.

John West (Contractors) Ltd –

- Access for materials will be from the rear courtyard where a hoist will be positioned
- Edge protection will be supplied to the exposed edges of the roof with a triple rail bolted to the fabric of the building with Hilti bolts – *this is not practical as there is no external access to a large area of the perimeter of the building from the adjoining properties.*
- The fall risk through the Atrium will be managed by overlaying the Atrium with 18m plywood boards – *there are no details of how these will be fixed to prevent them slipping into the valley gutter.*
- There is cost for a crash deck below the glazing should the client want it at £12,000 plus VAT
- There is no cost for a crash deck below the asbestos roof included within the tender, netting has been included with a requirement for the room to be cleared.

Span Roofing Ltd –

- Access for materials will be from a scaffold to the side of the rear courtyard double doors.
- Scaffold to the rear elevation in the access alley will need permissions which need to be arranged by the client – *this is a similar issue as raised above in relation to this scaffold*
- The fall risk through the Atrium will be managed by building a crash deck below the glass roof – this cost is included within the tender.
- There is cost for a crash deck below the asbestos roof included within the tender.

4.0 Financial Assessment

4.01 Tenders

A copy of the priced schedules of works have been submitted by, John West (Contractors) Ltd and Span Roofing Ltd. These are the contractors who have submitted the lowest two prices, these have been provided for assessment, given the nature of the works both contractors have included provisional sums

4.02 Provisional sums

All of the contractors have included the following provisional sums in accordance with the tender instructions and the specification document:-

- Provisional sum of £1,500 plus VAT to be spent at the discretion of the contract administrator in connection with localised timber repairs to stairs as required below felt roofing, clause D30.
- Contingency sum of £5,000 plus VAT to be spent at the discretion of the contract administrator

These provisional sums are for work that could not be accurately defined at the time of specification due to its hidden nature, these provisional sums total £6,500.00 and are contained within all five tenders.

Set out below are the provisional sums included by the contractors within their detailed returns.

4.02.1 John West (Contractors) Ltd

John West's priced summary included no provisional sums within the tender figure above the £6,500.00 plus VAT itemised above and included by all contractors.

4.02.2 Span Roofing Ltd

Span Roofing's priced summary included the following Provisional Sums:-

<u>Section</u>	<u>Item</u>	<u>Location</u>	<u>Works</u>	<u>Provisional Sum £s</u> <u>Excluding VAT.</u>
D	27	Roof Coverings	Allow for all access to undertake works	£7,500.00
Total Provisional Sums				£7,500.00

The provisional sums included by Span Roofing Ltd amount to £7,500.00 plus VAT, in addition to the £6,500.00 plus VAT itemised above and included by all contractors. This item relates to additional safety measure the contractor believes should be undertaken.

4.03 Qualifications & Clarifications

There are several qualifications and clarifications included within the tenders submitted.

4.03.1 John West (Contractors) Ltd

John West's priced summary included the following qualifications & clarifications:-

General Clarifications

Comment regarding the risk posed by the glass Atrium to operatives working on the roof and highlighting an option to avoid scaffolding. The option needs further information as it is not practicable. There is an additional cost quoted of £12,000 to scaffold this area. This figure is not included within the tender.

The room below the asbestos roof needs to be cleared by WsM TC staff.

Welfare facilities will be self-contained and positioned in the rear in front of the building.

Material access will be via a scaffold in the rear yard, labour access will be through the existing internal stairs.

The items above do have an impact on the scope of works, should the proposed method of work not be suitable there will be an additional £12,000 scaffold cost that is not included within the tender price.

Labour access through the museum will be disruptive to the museum operation.

There are no details on how the netting below the pitched asbestos roof is to be fitted.

4.03.2 Span Roofing Ltd

Span Roofing's priced summary included the following qualifications & clarifications:-

General Clarifications

Scaffold/access will be to the right of the large double doors to the museum. And will be secured with boards fixed to the base.

Details of the proposed method of asbestos cleaning included.

An alternative material for the treatment of the asbestos roof has been suggested, this is a better product with a 20-year guarantee.

A provisional sum has been included for protection below the pitched asbestos roof, this figure is included within the tender.

There is a comment on the fixing of the scaffold to the rear of the building in the access alleyway.

There is confirmation that internal scaffold will be required to the atrium. This cost is included within the tender.

The items above do have impact on the programming of the scope of works. The costs raised above are included in the priced tender.

4.04 Tender Evaluation

The tender from John West (Contractors) Ltd has been checked through and further clarification is required before the tender is accepted. The tender from Span Roofing is suitable and sufficient for contract purposes. Should the John West costs vary this tender may become viable.

The tenders from Honeyfield Property Services Ltd, Chedvale Construction Ltd and Hearn & Sons Roofing Ltd were not competitive. These tenders have not been checked in detail.

5.0 Summary

5.01 Summary:

Five contractors have submitted tenders that are acceptable for contract purposes, two contractors have declined to tender.

John West (Contractors) Ltd have submitted the lowest tender at ££78,475.00 plus VAT, Span Roofing Ltd are second at £84,346.00.

5.02 Recommendation:

We recommend that negotiations are entered into with John West (Contractors) Ltd who submitted the lowest tender, to confirm start date, programme and Health & Safety proposals and to clarify the method of works and materials proposed. Should these clarifications lead to an increase in the tender sum and John West (Contractors) Ltd no longer be the cheapest tender then, we recommend that negotiations are entered into with Span Roofing Ltd who submitted the second lowest tender, to confirm start date, programme and Health & Safety proposals

Tender Assessment
Contract: Replacement of Flat Roof Coverings – Weston Museum
Client: Weston-super-Mare Town Council

Appendix A

Completed Forms of Tender

Tender Assessment
Contract: Replacement of Flat Roof Coverings – Weston Museum
Client: Weston-super-Mare Town Council

Appendix B

John West Priced Documents

Tender Assessment
Contract: Replacement of Flat Roof Coverings – Weston Museum
Client: Weston-super-Mare Town Council

Appendix C

Span Roofing Priced Documents